

environmental
law series



DEFENDING PESTICIDES IN LITIGATION

2005 Edition

Mark J. Carpenter
George W. Ware

THOMSON
WEST

DEFENDING PESTICIDES IN LITIGATION

2005 Edition

By George W. Ware and Mark J. Carpenter

THOMSON
—★—™
WEST

For Customer Assistance Call 1-800-328-4880

About the Authors

George W. Ware was the Associate Director of the Agricultural Experiment Station for nine years and former Head of the Department of Entomology for sixteen years at the University of Arizona, Tucson. He holds a Ph.D. in Entomology and Plant Pathology from Kansas State University, and consults regularly on projects involving pesticides. He has written extensively on pesticide use, including four books. He can be contacted via e-mail at gware7@aol.com.

Mark J. Carpenter is a partner with the firm of Faegre & Benson LLP. Since 1995, he has focused his practice on the defense of pesticide, seed, and other agribusiness product manufacturers in litigation, including property damage, toxic tort, and commercial cases. In connection with this practice area, Mr. Carpenter has litigated preemption issues pursuant to the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act (FIFRA) in more than a dozen jurisdictions. Mark graduated magna cum laude from the University of Michigan Law School in 1993, where he served as an Associate Editor of the Michigan Law Review. After law school, he clerked for one year for the Honorable James M. Sprouse of the United States Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit. Mr. Carpenter received his undergraduate degree in 1991 from Kenyon College, where he graduated summa cum laude. He can be contacted through Faegre & Benson's website, at www.faegre.com, via e-mail at mcarpenter@faegre.com, or by telephone, (612) 766-7000.

Kristin R. Eads is an associate in the Minneapolis office of Faegre & Benson LLP. Since 1998, she has had an active litigation practice concentrating on product liability litigation. She has a particular focus on the agribusiness sector, defending major pesticide and seed manufacturers in a variety of litigation contexts throughout the country. Kristin received her law degree from Georgetown University Law Center in 1997 and her bachelor's degree from Cornell College in 1994. She can be contacted through Faegre & Benson's website at www.faegre.com, via e-mail at keads@faegre.com, or by telephone, (612) 766-7000.

Peter J. Goss is a partner in Faegre & Benson's Minneapolis office where he practices in complex litigation and product liability. He defends product liability and toxic tort actions involving a variety of products and industries, and places a particular focus on ensuring the validity of expert scientific testimony. He has led a number of successful *Daubert* challenges, including *Willert v. Ortho Pharmaceutical Co.*, 995 F. Supp. 979 (D. Minn. 1998) and *Medalen v. DuPont Powder Coatings USA, et al.*, 269 F. Supp. 2d 1118 (D. Minn. 2003). He has worked extensively with human health experts in defending toxic tort claims, and also has significant experience with agricultural economists, plant pathologists, and plant physiologists in defending crop injury claims. Peter attended law school at Boalt Hall School of Law, at the University of California, Berkeley, where he received his J.D. in 1996. He is the author of *Guiding the Hand that Feeds: Toward Socially Optimal Appropriability in Agricultural Biotechnology Innovation*, 84 Calif. L. Rev. 1395. Peter received a B.A. in 1991 and a Master's in 1995 from U.C. Berkeley. He can be contacted through Faegre & Benson's website, at www.faegre.com, via e-mail at PGoss@Faegre.com, or by telephone, (612) 766-7000.

John M. Johnson is a member of the firm of Lightfoot, Franklin & White, L.L.C., of Birmingham, Alabama. He was the co-author, along with George Ware, of the **Pesticide Litigation Manual**, a predecessor work to this volume. He

concentrates his practice on environmental injury claims, including toxic torts and property damage. He has a wide variety of experience in pesticide litigation, including defense of cases involving alleged personal injury and crop damage. He received his undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia in 1979 and his law degree from Vanderbilt University in 1982. He can be contacted through Lightfoot, Franklin & White's website at www.lfwlaw.com, through email at jjohnsonlfwlaw.com or by phone at (205) 581-0716.

Ross W. Johnson is an associate in the Des Moines office of Faegre & Benson LLP. He is engaged in general practice, including, but not limited to, litigation, agricultural law, commercial law, and product liability. He has represented chemical and seed manufacturers in products liability litigation, as well as in related commercial disputes. Mr. Johnson joined Faegre & Benson in 2000, after practicing in Phoenix, Arizona for three years. Mr. Johnson received his law degree in 1997 from the University of Iowa, where he was a member of the *Iowa Law Review* and was named to the *Order of the Coif*. Mr. Johnson received his B.A. in 1993 from Arizona State University. He graduated from ASU *summa cum laude* and was inducted into *Phi Beta Kappa*. Mr. Johnson can be contacted through Faegre & Benson's website at www.faegre.com, via e-mail at rwjohnson@faegre.com, or by telephone at (515) 248-9000.

Dara D. Mann is a partner with the firm of Faegre & Benson LLP. Since 1996, she has had an active litigation practice concentrating on product liability litigation. She defends major pesticide manufacturers and their products, primarily in toxic tort, personal injury, commercial disputes and related litigation throughout the country. She has assisted clients with federal and state pesticide registration issues in many jurisdictions. Additionally, Ms. Mann has worked extensively with experts in the areas of toxicology, epidemiology, plant pathology, horticulture and agricultural economy. Ms. Mann received her law degree from Emory University School of Law and her undergraduate degree from Agnes Scott College with honors. She can be contacted through Faegre & Benson's website, at www.faegre.com, via e-mail at dmann@faegre.com, or by telephone, (612) 766-7000.

Julie A. Murphy is a paralegal in Faegre & Benson LLP's Des Moines office. She has extensive experience in general commercial, employment discrimination, and civil rights litigation. In addition to her Paralegal Certificate from Roosevelt University in Chicago, Julie also holds graduate and undergraduate degrees from the University of Iowa and Drake University. She can be contacted through Faegre & Benson's website at www.faegre.com, via e-mail at jmurphy@faegre.com, or by telephone, (515) 248-9000.

James E. Springer II is an associate in the Minneapolis office of Faegre & Benson LLP. He has a litigation practice with a primary focus on the agribusiness sector. He also practices in the areas of product liability, commercial law, and general tort litigation. James joined Faegre & Benson in 2003, following law school at the University of Minnesota, and after receiving his B.A. from Concordia College in Moorhead, Minnesota. He can be contacted through Faegre & Benson's website at www.faegre.com, via e-mail at jspringer@faegre.com, or by telephone, (612) 766-7000.

Allan A. Thoen is an associate in the Minneapolis office of Faegre & Benson LLP. He has a litigation practice with a principal focus on the agribusiness sector. He represents pesticide and seed manufacturers in a variety of contexts, and has experience with legal issues related to product liability claims, UCC warranty claims, federal and state pesticide regulations, and consumer fraud claims. Allan joined Faegre & Benson in 2001, following law school at the University of Pennsylvania, and after receiving his B.A. from Macalester College. He can be contacted through Faegre & Benson's website at www.faegre.com, via e-mail at athoen@faegre.com, or by telephone, (612) 766-7000.

Summary of Table of Contents

		Page
Chapter 1	An Overview of the Pesticide Industry	1
Chapter 2	A Litigator's Guide to FIFRA	23
Chapter 3	Highlights from the Food Quality Protection Act of 1996	55
Chapter 4	Reporting Adverse Effects Under FIFRA Section 6(a)(2)	77
Chapter 5	Theories of Liability	93
Chapter 6	Defenses in Pesticide Cases	129
Chapter 7	The FIFRA Preemption Defense	167
Chapter 8	Causation in Pesticide Cases	199
Chapter 9	Scientific Evidence in Pesticide Litigation	221
Chapter 10	Novel Damage Theories	259
Chapter 11	Discovery in Pesticide Cases	281
Chapter 12	Identifying Pesticides and Finding Information	295
Appendix 12T	Tables: Identifying Pesticides	310
Appendix 12D	Diagrams: Identifying Pesticides	317
Chapter 13	Mode of Chemical Action— A Crucial Concept for Lawyers	321
Appendix 13D	Diagrams: Mode of chemical action	346
Chapter 14	Chemicals Used to Control Invertebrates	355
Appendix 14D	Diagrams: Chemicals controlling invertebrates	384
Chapter 15	Chemicals Used to Control Vertebrates	419
Appendix 15T	Table: Chemicals Controlling Vertebrates	427
Appendix 15D	Diagrams: Chemicals Controlling Vertebrates	428
Chapter 16	Chemicals Used to Control Plants	437
Appendix 16D	Diagrams: Chemicals Controlling Plants	458
Chapter 17	Chemicals Used to Control Microorganisms	495
Appendix 17T	Table: Chemicals Controlling Microorganisms	515
Appendix 17D	Diagrams: Chemicals Controlling Microorganisms	516
Chapter 18	Biorational Pesticides	545
Appendix 18T	Table: Biorational pesticides	553
Appendix 18D	Diagrams: Biorational pesticides	557
Chapter 19	The Problem of Resistance to Pesticides	559
Appendix 19T	Table: Resistance to pesticides	566
Appendix 19D	Diagrams: Resistance to pesticides	570
Chapter 20	Toxicity and Hazards of Pesticides	571
Appendix 20T	Table: Toxicity and hazards	578
Appendix 20D	Diagrams: Toxicity and hazards	595
Chapter 21	Pesticide Toxicity to Nontarget Species	597
Appendix 21T	Table: Toxicity to nontarget species	618
Chapter 22	Safe Handling and Storage of Pesticides	619

Appendix 22D	Diagrams: Handling and storage	625
Chapter 23	Finding Experts in Pesticide Cases	627
Appendix 23T	Table: Finding pesticide experts	629
Appendices		
Appendix A	Insecticides, Insect Growth Regulators, Acaricides and Nematicides	App. A-1
Appendix B	Herbicides, Herbicide Safeners and Plant Growth Regulators	App. B-1
Appendix C	Fungicides and Bactericides	App. C-1
Appendix D	Rodenticides	App. D-1
Appendix E	Directory of Colleges of Agriculture in State Land Grant Universities	App. E-1
Appendix F	Effective use of the pesticide exception to CERCLA	App. F-1
Appendix G	Glossary	App. G-1
Index		Index-1